



A SYMBOL OF
PENSIONERS' UNITY
MEMBER SCOVA

BHARAT PENSIONERS' SAMAJ

ESTABLISHED IN : 1955

(All India Federation of Pensioners' Associations)
(Registered No. 2023 of 1962-63)

Member International Federation on Ageing. Montreal (Canada)
2/13-A - LGF Backside, Jangpura - 'A', New Delhi - 110 014

Mobile : 09868488199 | Telephone : 011-24376642

E-mail : bharatpensioner@gmail.com | Website : www.bharatpensioner.org

Correspondence Address : 410-A/411-A, Swaminarayan Avenue, Near A.E.C. Over Bridge, 132 ft. Ring Road, Naranpura, Ahmedabad - 380013.
Ph. : (O) 079-27476566 | (M) +91 98790 90682 | E-mail : didimistry@gmail.com | Web : www.bdpa.in

No: BPS/BDPA(I)/FP/PNB/1

dated 15th March, 2022

To:

Dr. Kamal Kapoor,

Controller of Communication Accounts,

Gujarat Telecom Region,

7th Floor, P & T Administrative Building,

Opp. Khanpur Post Office, Ahmedabad-380001

Sub: A request to intervene & re-examine Family Pensioner's Case – Case of Pooja N. Bhatt, Divorcee Daughter of later Shri N.K. Bhatt, Retired D.E. A.T.D. Ahmedabad.

Respected Sir,

1. We are fully aware of the fact that all cases for Family Pension for Unmarried/Divorcee daughter and handicapped son are to be – on getting representation from aggrieved pensioner – are to be initially investigated and decided by the BSNL Offices as per standard yardstick laid down in the Rules.
2. The office of the CCA comes in picture on receiving such application accepted/rejected with required details for satisfying himself and issuing PPO for recommended application.
3. Had the Office of the Pr. General Manager Telecom, Ahmedabad Telecom District, Ahmedabad followed such script, we would have not approached your office to take your valued time.
4. We have studied the case on the strength of papers shown to us by the Pensioner and sincerely feel that the o/o the PGM ATD Ahmedabad has not done justice to a poor lady who is eagerly and anxiously waiting to know the fate of her case and apparently erred on many counts, we feel your intervention is essential as your office is final competent authority to take decision in the matter.
5. We had advised the aggrieved lady to represent her case with required details for examining the case by your office as her further approach to the o/o PGM ATD Ahmedabad will obviously yield no fruitful result.
6. Sir, we with a ray of hope in your office request you kindly examine the case by your office or to forward the case from your office to the o/o PGM ATD Ahmedabad with specific

guidelines/for Timebound investigation; as we know that nothing positive could be expected from the o/o PGM ATD Ahmedabad who it has no sympathy for such cases and deals with negative mindset.

7. We reasonably feel that as per the procedure in vogue, your office has to play key roll on such cases and has to correct the investigating agency if it errs in investigating the case. The offices of the SSA Heads are entrusted such work on your behalf as your office has no net work in the state and BSNL is to follow the instruction to investigate such cases and can not considerate it as additional work irrespective of any genuine reason of shortage of staff or presence of knowledgeable persons with them.
8. We are fully convinced that the poor lady is suffering since last three years and will have no end to her agony unless, the case is looked in to by competent authorities. We, therefore, instead of elaborating and commenting upon the working of the office of the PGM ATD Ahmedabad, forward herewith a case of Smt. Pooja N. Bhatt, 4, Lalita Devi Society, Near Nav Nirman High School, Ranip, Ahmedabad-382480. Cell: 9427629786 dated 09.03.2022 accompanied with required documents to elucidate her say.
9. We reproduce the saliant points of the investigation with our say thereon.

A) That applicant is divorcee Daughter of later Shri N.K. Bhatt, Retired D.E. A.T.D. Ahmedabad, residing at 4, Lalita Devi Society, Near Nav Nirman High School, Ranip, Ahmedabad-382480; who retired as Divisional Engineer, MDF on 31.12.1995 and drawing pension vide PPO No: ATT/Pen.3/5/845/6 and expired on 25.09.2018 (Death Certificate attached as Annexure 1).

B) Her marriage was dissolved by the Competent Court in H.M.P. No. 299 OF 1993 BY THE Judgment and Decree dated 24.02.1998 (i.e., when her father was alive). (Copy of Decree attached as Annexure 3).

C) As such, she being eligible for Family Pension as per Rule 54 of CCA (Pension Rules 1972) made application on 24.01.2019 to the Pr. General Manager Telecom, Ahmedabad Telecom District, Ahmedabad, furnishing above information. (Copy enclosed – Annexure 4).

D) From the information, she got through her RTI Application dated 01.04.2021 and PGM ATD No; GJAHD-41/16/2/2021-GJAHD-ADMN/LEGAL (RTI-01/2021-22) dated 29.04.2021; we come to conclusion as under:

- I. That as per Note Sheet No.1, a committee consisting DA (ATD), SDE (Welfare), ATD, AGM (Genl) ATD and A.O. (F), ATD was formed by AGM (Gen) on 04.12.2010.
- II. Inclusion of DA (ATD) is questionable.
- III. The Committee gave its report on 29.01.2020 REPEAT 29.01.2020, vide No: AT/WL-70/F. P/NKB/2019-20/04 dated 29.01.2020 (copy enclosed Annexure 6).
- IV. Observation made in Para 5 is totally baseless and incorrect, I have never stated that I my income if Rs.5000/- per month.
- V. Para 7, itself proves that it is predetermined and pre-decided visit or otherwise it should have waited for examination of additional documents which they had asked.
- VI. They had forgotten the fact that they had come to verify information submitted by the Family Pensioner for Family Pension and not for Compassionate Appointment

for which such documents are required and word “indigent” is to be used to justify or reject Compassionate Appointment application.

VII. In Note Sheet No.5, reads:

“As per book Pension made easy, Page 73 Point No. 10, Sons/Daughters Widowed and divorced daughters will become ineligible for grant of family pension when he/she gets income of Rs.3500/- more per month.”

The Inquiring Officers/official and Administration head have erred in that judgement as primary fact that they are deciding a case of DoT, for whom deference yardstick are in force as per DOPPW and DoT guide lines, i.e., Rs. 9000/- per month. This has been endorsed by GM(A) ???

VIII. Further, in the same note sheet, GM (A) writes:

“This is family pension case of Poojaben N. Bhatt daughter of late shri Narendra K. Bhatt. The Committee visited residence of Poojaben and found that Poojaben is not living in indignant condition and hence does not fulfill the criteria to get family pension. Her monthly earning is to be 5000 to 6000 per month whereas prescribed limit is Rs.3500/- PM. Hence, we may regret the case, pls.”

This note is written on 17.07.2020 by most competent officer of the Department, working as General Manager (Administration), which speak out his knowledge and authority to consider such case.

IX. In turn, the PGM has approved the proposal on the same day as note sheet indicates.

X. The final order approved on 17.07.2020

CONVENIENTLY FOR ANY REASON WHATSOEVER THE OFFICE OF THE PGM ATD AHMEDABAD preferred to maintain deliberate silence for more than two years.

E) Only after receiving application from the aggrieved pensioner under RTI, office of the PGM ATD Ahmedabad awoke and asked her vide letter No: AT/WL/70/FP/NKP/2019 Dated 18.10.2021 to furnish documents and her monthly income.

F) She furnished required information vide my application dated 16.11.2021 and stated that her earning is Rs.2500/- per month doing house hold work.

G) she I was shocked and pained to receive a letter No; AT/WL-70/F.P./PNB/2020-21/11 dated 16.02.2022, which reads:

“With reference to above cited subject and your reference letter, as per committee report, applicant family is not living in indigent condition and hence your case of Family Pension not considered please.”

Sir, we wish to point out the following errors in investigation.

A. That case relates to DoT Pensioner and as such all rules for income **are applicable as per C.G. Pension Rules 1972, where monthly income is prescribed as Rs. 9000- per month.**

- B. our learner Officers have stated “As per book Pension made easy, Page 73 Point No. 10, Sons/Daughters Widowed and divorced daughters will become ineligible for grant of family pension when he/she gets income of Rs.3500/- more per month.”
Sir, here the Rules for C.G. Pensioners are applicable which prescribed monthly limit of Rs.9000/-
- C. She is residing in her father’s house, which is in the name of four occupants and she is one of them.
- D) Whatever the Fixed Deposit was given by her father is now completely consumed in facing worst pandemic Covid-19.
- F) Investigation made in the year 2019 can not be believed to be true after two years as it is based upon wrong concept.

The Association, therefore, with all respects to your august office, requests to kindly look in to the case on priority base and award the justice to a poor lady who is suffering since last three years with a ray of hope from your good self.

With regards,

Yours Sincerely,



(D.D. MISTRY)

Secretary BSNL/PSU

Encl: as stated,

Copy to:

1. Shri Ashwini Vaishnav, MOC, New Delhi
2. Shri Amitbhai Shah, Home Minister, New Delhi
3. Shri Dr. Jitendra Singh, MOS, New Delhi
4. Shri K. Rajaraman (IAS), Secretary, DoT, New Delhi
5. Shri P.K. Purwar, CMD BSNL, New Delhi
6. Shri S.C. Maheshwari, SG BPS New Delhi
7. Shri V Srinivas, DOPPW, New Delhi
8. Shri Sandeep Sawarkar, ITS, CGM Telecom, Gujarat, Ahmedabad-3800091

BHARAT PENSIONER

A Monthly Magazine of Pensioners for
Pensioners by Pensioners

READ

BSNL PENSIONERS NEWS GUJARAT

A Quarterly Magazine for Pensioners by
BSNL & DOT Pensioners Association (India)

